



## PUBLIC SERVICES BOARD – DATE 24<sup>TH</sup> JUNE 2021

**SUBJECT: PARTICIPATORY BUDGET**

**REPORT BY: TINA MCMAHON, CCBC / WILL BEER, PHW**

---

### **1. BACKGROUND**

- 1.1 Participatory Budgeting (PB) originated in Brazil in the 1980s, spread worldwide and is a method of giving local people the opportunity to decide where public money is spent in their communities. PB is driven by the desire to reallocate public money at a community level to services and initiatives identified as priorities by residents.
- 1.2 With a participatory budget, citizens have the opportunity to allocate resources, prioritise social policies, and monitor public spending. It is a highly democratic concept that has many strengths:
- It gives community members a voice and builds bridges between citizens, councillors, and officers.
  - It generates social capital by sparking debate and giving citizens insight into each other's needs. Participatory budgeting has the potential to lead to more social cohesion.
  - It leads to better decisions that are more widely supported by citizens.
  - It helps citizens gain better insight into how their governments work. By involving citizens in important (financial) decisions, they grasp a better understanding of the decision-making process.
  - It leads to better public services. Giving citizens a voice on which public services are most needed and where they are most urgent overall increases the quality of public services.
- 1.3 Despite its great strengths, participatory budgeting can come with its downsides. Before launching it is essential to have a clear view of the main challenges that maybe encountered along the way. Consequently, we intend to run a workshop session facilitated by Cardiff University to ensure a high level of collective understanding at the beginning, for the overall scope of the project and the direction that the PB process will take, covering the following points:

### **2. VISIONS AND AIMS**

Both the PB process and its evaluation will benefit from a clear vision and aims from the outset, and by defining the community to be served by the PB process. Project aims should align with the vision but may include more details as to what the PB process specifically aims to achieve.

### **3. THE POSSIBLE COMPLEXITY OF THE PROCESS**

Implementing PB can be quite complex. It's not something that can be created overnight with just a little bit of good will. It takes time to set up and requires the collaboration of multiple departments and organisations. The success of the entire process also relies on citizens and officers understanding how budgets are attributed and how the voting system works. It's important to factor in time to allow for training for both staff and community members.

### **4. OVERCOMING BIAS**

This is a common question in the realm of citizen participation in general. How do you ensure that the group of citizens engaging is representative for the population as a whole? How do you reach those people that may be less inclined to participate, like certain minority groups?

### **5. EVALUATION**

From an evaluative perspective it is important to be able articulate how the decision made through the PB process relates to the community context and how it will improve circumstances for residents or conditions within the area and these will be evidenced and monitored.

### **6. LEADERSHIP**

It is important to be clear who is leading the PB process and what the parameters of the leadership are. Will the PB process be led by professionals or will community groups and members take on the process leadership?

### **7. FACILITATION**

At this early stage it is important to have clarity on who will facilitate the PB process. It is highly beneficial if PB facilitators have a good knowledge of the community but ideally, they would be independent of the local groups and organisations involved.

### **8. RESOURCES**

Clarity as to the financial resources (and in-kind contributions from partner agencies involved, if appropriate, e.g. staff time) allocated to the overall process and the funding available for PB projects, is beneficial for all concerned and for the evaluation.

### **9. TIMESCALES**

It is also helpful to be clear on the anticipated timescales for the spending of resources and for the overall PB process. Furthermore, it is important to consider the ambition for how long the PB funded projects will be in operation, and their long-term sustainability should they prove beneficial to that community.

### **10. DESIGN**

It is important within the evaluation to compile a clear account of the democratic process – that is, the collective discussion and agreement on community priorities, development of project funding proposals and the voting mechanism whereby community members decide on the projects to fund.

### **11. GOVERNANCE**

It is proposed that the process will be overseen by the Integrated Partnership Board, which can subsequently report to the Public Services Board.

**12. FOR APPROVAL**

We are asking the PSB for approval for the workshops and the governance to be overseen by the Integrated Partnership Board.

Annex attached with 3 appendices

# Annex - IWN AND PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING 2021-22

David Llewellyn, IWN Lead Caerphilly, May 2021

## 1. BACKGROUND TO INTEGRATED WELLBEING NETWORKS

Integrated Wellbeing Networks (IWNs) were devised in the ABUHB area in keeping with A Healthier Wales (2018) which set out a “long-term future vision of a **whole system** approach to health and social care’ focused on health and wellbeing, and on preventing illness.”

A IWN Baseline Review undertaken to devise the model in 2018 indicated: ‘there is increasing recognition that an exclusive focus on needs and deficits can result in people feeling disempowered and dependent, becoming passive recipients of services rather than active agents in their own lives. There is a widely held view that co-producing solutions with people, building on individual strengths and abilities, and nurturing readily available community-based assets is a more sustainable way of building well-being and resilience in the community and thus reducing the pressures on health and social care.’

In 2019, the Welsh Government Transformation Fund awarded funding to the (Gwent) Regional Partnership Board for investment plus the development of five (5) transformation projects, including Integrated Wellbeing Networks.

The objectives of the IWN programme are:

1. Establish place-based co-ordination and development of wellbeing resources.
2. Identify ways that hubs can be centres for wellbeing resources in the community.
3. Develop the well-being ‘workforce’ - people delivering services and support).
4. Ensure easy access to well-being information and support.
5. Lay the foundations for a sustainable approach to Integrated Wellbeing Networks across Gwent

IWN development was initiated in April 2019 in the Blaenau Gwent, Caerphilly, Newport, and Torfaen local authority areas. In Caerphilly, it had been agreed that the initial focus would be on the Neighbourhood Care Network (NCN) North, essentially the middle and upper Rhymney valley, with a possibility of also working in the Lansbury park area of Caerphilly.

### 1.1 IWN Development progress April 2019 - February 2020; a summary

Extensive engagement and relationship building developed a network of over 200 people across services, groups, and organisations in the localities, all of whom were fully informed and engaged with the aims of the Integrated Wellbeing Networks by Autumn 2019. We also ensured these were aware of the parallel *Compassionate Communities* programme operating at that time.

By early 2020, in keeping with agreed workplan, place-based Wellbeing Collectives had been established in the Caerphilly North NCN pilot area in Rhymney, New Tredegar and Bargoed.

We also specifically supported partners outside the NCN pilot area when approached through meetings with groups and organisations, e.g., in Blackwood (NCN East) and the

Aber Valley (NCN South). We explored the opportunity to support ongoing work in the Lansbury Park area, looking to work with the All-Wales Public Service Graduate Scheme worker, and attending a meeting of the 'Coalition of Change'; but it appeared there were no further Coalition of Change meetings and we decided to focus on the wellbeing collaboratives in the NCN North.

Further to the engagement work, initial mapping of local wellbeing resources and wider development meetings - each of the Wellbeing Collectives met on three occasions. These utilised a 'postcards from the future' approach, developing a local Theory of Change in effect, to engage partners in beginning to create a collective vision of sustaining and improving wellbeing in each area through enhanced collaboration across sectors, based on Assets Based Community Development (ABCD) principles.

The last meetings were held in each location between January and March 2020; the collective desired wellbeing outcomes were to be used as the basis for **co-developed wellbeing plans** for each locality - strengthening existing collaborative working, empowering community organisations to lead, facilitating peer-to-peer support, and developing new opportunities to enhance local wellbeing developed in January 2020. These locality based plans are to be developed through Participatory Budgeting with the use of the Early Years and Prevention Fund allocation.

## 1.2 IWN participatory budgeting – progress to date

In early 2020, the IWN programme was funded for a further year through the Welsh Government Transformation Fund with an additional £100,000 obtained to develop IWNs and wellbeing plans in the local authority areas, specifically focused on communities identified as within the scope of the Transformation programme.

On March 4<sup>th</sup> 2020, Will Beer and Mererid Bowley from ABUHB met with Kath Peters, Rob Hartshorn and Mark S. Williams representing Caerphilly CBC where it was agreed the additional funding would be allocated via participatory budgeting with a cross-organisational oversight group, operating under the auspices of the PSB, to determine the precise mechanism.

It was stipulated clearly that the funding allocation was to further develop Participatory Budgeting as a means of developing Integrated Wellbeing Networks in the local authority area. Moreover, it should be used as a catalyst for community-led solutions and to enhance community assets to improve the health and wellbeing of local communities. This was confirmed in a letter to Mark S Williams and the monies accepted by Caerphilly CBC on that basis.

This was right at the start of the pandemic and subsequent lockdowns, and consequently, opportunities to pursue and develop Participatory Budgeting were significantly impacted. There were no more meetings of the PSB until November 2020 and we entered further severe restrictions not long afterwards. However, we have indicated at online IWN collaborative meetings, reinitiated since autumn 2020, that we would ensure those communities have the opportunity for participatory budgeting as intended once the oversight

mechanism is established.

It should be noted that an additional £165,000 was allocated in early 2021 under the same stipulations, as confirmed by Finance Director at ABUHB.

*The funding is in addition to the £100,000 funding that was provided in 2019/20, and is to further develop Participatory Budgeting as a means of developing Integrated Wellbeing Networks in your local authority area. It should be used as a catalyst for community led solutions and to enhance community assets to improve the health and well-being of local communities. There is an expectation that this funding will align to the priorities in Building a Healthier Gwent, PSB well-being objectives and Covid-19 recovery plans (**appendix 1**). It should focus on communities identified as within the scope of the Transformation programme in relation to place-based care. The governance arrangements for the use of these funds should sit with the structures already in place under your Public Service Board.”*

Between February and April 2021, having been informed that Caerphilly CBC had indicated it had plans to develop a Community Empowerment Fund, there was an exchange of emails and had a Teams meeting with Hayley Lancaster at Caerphilly CBC to progress IWN PB funding oversight governance and get the mechanisms sorted, and to ascertain how this could complement CCBC plans and Community Empowerment Fund.

As a result, a further Teams meeting was held with Tina McMahon and her Caerphilly Cares staff in which it was confirmed that Dave Street would now be providing oversight from a Caerphilly CBC perspective. We have not yet had sight of the Caerphilly CBC Community Empowerment Fund proposals so it is not possible from an IWN perspective to understand the opportunities and processes for how these will complement each other.

**Consequently, we need to agree the oversight process and mechanism in keeping with the stated and agreed focus for the IWN participatory budget funding.**

## **2 POSSIBLE MECHANISMS FOR PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING (PB)**

PB originated in Porto Alegre, Brazil at the end of the 1980s as a means for redistributing wealth and improving transparency of decision making by empowering local citizens.

In more developed countries, PB is focused more on public engagement and project implementation rather than resource redistribution and mainstream budget allocation. In the UK, PB has been seen as a means of increasing community engagement, empowerment, cohesion, and pride and used on a more modest scale than other European countries, primarily involving the allocation of small grants. However, there have been more significant examples. For example, in England, Tower Hamlets allocated over £5 million while Newcastle-upon-Tyne set aside £2.25 million for PB projects.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> [https://www.wcpp.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2017/08/PPIW-report\\_participatory-budgeting-evidence-review\\_July-2017-FINAL.pdf](https://www.wcpp.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2017/08/PPIW-report_participatory-budgeting-evidence-review_July-2017-FINAL.pdf)

Leighninger and Rinehart (2016) identified five stages to a PB process<sup>2</sup>

1. Allocation of a portion of a public body's budget to PB.
2. Articulating what the 'need' is that will be addressed through the PB process.
3. Development of project proposals.
4. Selection of projects to be funded.
5. Authorities/organisations then commit to implementing the winning projects which are subsequently monitored and reported on.

As outlined by the Public Policy Institute for Wales (see 1), there are challenges associated with PB and we need to ensure these are met effectively – the IWN development work should help significantly in these.

- Engagement and representation
- Sustaining the process
- Tangible outcomes and a transparent process
- Measurement and evidence for PB
- Governance and capacity

These should be discussed in the next stage of development to ensure those challenges are met.

## 2.1 Examples of PB using neutral organisations.

Several organisations have undertaken community PB work. These include:

### **Mutual Gain**

The Newport and Blaenau Gwent IWNs, working with the local authorities, have proceeded with participatory budgeting using **Mutual Gain**<sup>3</sup>. As Mutual Gain indicate, PB is designed to empower communities and help them to work with local agencies to develop solutions to problems that are affecting their lives. It should always be considered as part of a community engagement process.

*“The Newport community will decide who will be awarded the money based on the projects that they like the most, once we establish a community steering group to help plan and shape the criteria for the programme. You will participate in PB training and then four supported delivery sessions where we will; shape the programme, invite bidders to apply for funding, see the applications fit the criteria set, and plan the decision day where the wider community will be invited to vote.”*

There are associated costs in using **Mutual Gain** which are often around £15,000. The process consists of one day of training followed by 4 x 2hr supported delivery sessions. This is where the key decisions are made, and the logistics are planned. Mutual Gain staff attend the final decision day to help ensure that the presentation and voting process run smoothly.

---

<sup>2</sup> [https://www.publicagenda.org/files/PowertothePeople\\_PublicAgenda\\_2016.pdf](https://www.publicagenda.org/files/PowertothePeople_PublicAgenda_2016.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> <https://www.mutualgain.org/>

This process can be delivered in 12 weeks. **Appendix 2** indicates the projects supported with the initial tranche of IWN PB funding in Newport.

There are undoubted benefits to the Mutual Gain process with the organisation acting a transparent 'honest broker'. However, in addition to the costs, some of the initial work they undertake might be seen as repeating what has been done to date in developing the IWN place-based wellbeing collaboratives.

## **Involve**

Involve describe themselves as “the UK's public participation charity, on a mission to put people at the heart of decision-making”.

They have conducted work across the UK though they have no office in Wales. Examples of their work include being commissioned through open tender to run the Devon Climate Assembly. They independently facilitated the Assembly as well as supporting members to get online and fully participate in the process.

Both Mutual Gain and Involve offer a neutral route for how the PB is conducted. However, we have not followed this up to date in Caerphilly because, as agreed last year, we have been waiting to find out what the governance arrangements are.

## **3. RISKS IN NOT IMPLEMENTING PB AS AGREED**

The IWNs have been funded under the Welsh Government Transformation Fund and the PB funding allocated to further development of IWNs and community-led initiatives. In Newport and Blaenau Gwent (and developing in Torfaen), the PB mechanisms have been agreed in conjunction with the local authorities and these are developing community-led initiatives. In Newport, funding has already been allocated using Mutual Gain.

We have developed wellbeing collectives in four areas to date in Caerphilly and these have begun to develop collective ideas for community-led initiatives that will support and enhance local wellbeing. There is a clear expectation asset out in the agreement that PB will be used in these areas to develop the IWNs and community-led initiatives.

Clearly the pandemic impacted on that development over the last year. But the community groups and the wellbeing collectives have continued to meet to develop ideas and, with restrictions now lessening, we need to work with those collectives on how we can continue to develop and progress opportunities. PB is the key next stage to developing the IWNs and ensuring that communities are actively involved in developing initiatives in keeping with the milestones set down in the **Delivery Agreement set out with Welsh Government** and under which funding has been allocated. In failing to adhere to these, there is a significant risk that RPB will be unable to deliver of the milestones agreed with Welsh Government (**Appendix 3**).

## **4. CONCLUSIONS**

- **We need to agree the oversight process and mechanisms in keeping with the stated and agreed focuses for the IWN participatory budget funding.**
- **There are opportunities through existing charities and organisations to do this, but we could develop an in-house solution under the auspices of the PSB.**
- **The mechanisms and governance need to be sorted a matter of priority and should complement the local authority Community Empowerment Fund.**

## APPENDIX 1 – IWN FUNDING FIT WITH STRATEGIC AIMS

As noted in the letter to Caerphilly CBC, there is an expectation that IWN funding will align to the priorities in Building a Healthier Gwent, PSB wellbeing objectives, and Covid-19 recovery plans.

### **Building a Healthier Gwent**

The Director of Public Health Annual Report 2019 'Building a Healthier Gwent' translates the opportunity provided by *A Healthier Wales* and the *Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015* into a new proposal for a long-term, integrated, and collaborative approach to closing the health inequalities gap that exists across Gwent. Following publication of the 'Building a Healthier Gwent' report in July 2019, the Aneurin Bevan Gwent Public Health Team ran an extensive involvement programme to gather the views of the people who live and work in Gwent about the contents of the report.

The results from the involvement programme were presented to the Gwent Regional Partnership Board and the G10 group of public sector leaders in Gwent. They have collectively agreed that reducing the 18-year difference in years in good health across Gwent should be a system wide priority. The Director of Public Health and Strategic Partnerships has been asked to develop a Building a Healthier Gwent Delivery Plan for further consideration early in 2020.

IWNs are viewed as a key mechanism for implementing Building a Healthier Gwent

<https://abuhb.nhs.wales/healthcare-services/staying-healthy/building-a-healthier-gwent/>

### **Caerphilly PSB**

Originated through the Regional Partnership Board, we have ensured the IWN work is clearly integrated and aligned with the work of the PSB.

As a result, the IWNs are now integrated as key delivery partners within the Good Health and Wellbeing theme of the PSB, especially AA3.4 Outcome 1 – 'More communities and residents are involved in place-based discussions and decisions regarding health and wellbeing.'

### **Community Post-COVID recovery**

In late August 2020, a series of community consultations with our local collectives explored issues that had arisen or been unearthed by the COVID-19 pandemic. These were online meetings with community members and services in our focus areas, and also Risca where we had begun to work with the local community facilitated through our pandemic support.

We continued this work with further meetings in which we explored the concept of a community wellbeing survey that will allow us and communities to understand better issues in those communities and how we can measure the impact of community-led measures and initiatives put in place.

The initiatives will fit with IWN Caerphilly 2021-22 plans we have set out in accordance with the Delivery Agreement with Welsh Government. These will build on the development work prior to 2020 and since and are in keeping with the principles of Build Back Fairer: The COVID-19 Marmot Review with Post COVID recovery as a focus.

ABCD will continue to be the IWN's overarching approach. We will ensure better tie-ins with primary care services in each area and seek to create a legacy with community empowerment especially via place-based collectives using a "What's Strong", not "What's Wrong".

This provides the basis for starting with the community assets and enables local people to become organised to address what is wrong and strengthen what is already strong. This will also ensure that communities are not defined by the sum of their deficits.

The IWN plan for 2020-21 has Interrelated Focus Themes and will ensure that PB is seen as a way of ensuring that communities determine how these develop as appropriate.

## APPENDIX 2 - Newport IWN PB-funded projects 2021

Project Title	Organisation	Area
Wellbeing and Local Knowledge Support for Senior Citizens	W.A.L.K. Newport	Malpas
Early Angels and Families	Anwara Begum	St Julians
Fit and Fed	County in the Community (Newport County AFC)	Maindee
Shahporan Bengali Adult Mental Wellbeing Project	Shahporan Bangladeshi jam'e mosque	Maindee
Bundles Baby Clothing Bank	Sally Lewis	Maindee
Sharing Carers Support	Parents for Change - Voluntary Community Group	St Julians
The Art Space	Action for Children	Beechwood
Online Arts and Crafts Workshop	Young Muslim and Community Organisation	Maindee
Play Bettws	Save the Children	Bettws
Social Group - Wellbeing Ambassadors	Newport Mind	Stow Hill
Laptops 4 Home Learning	Newport Uskmoth Rotary	Rogerstone
Programme of workshops for Newport Women's Group for refugees and asylum seekers	British Red Cross	Pillgwenlly
NCJM Youth Project	NCJM (Newport Central Jamia Masjid)	Maindee
Chartism Redrawn: Art in the Community	Our Chartist Heritage	Pillgwenlly
Growing Together George Street	Maindee Unlimited Pobl Group Ltd (George Street)	Maindee Pillgwenlly Newport Wide
Intergenerational Digital Inclusion Project	RCV UK	
Interactive Community Conversations - Young People (18-25)	Barrackswood & Harlequin Community Group	
Advocacy and Well-Being Service for Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic People and Older People and Their Carers	Ethnic Minorities and Youth Support Team Wales (EYST)	Maindee
Ceiling for change Community Leaders and Peer Mentoring to support children and young people and prevent harm in Newport	Community House Eton Road Kidscape	Maindee Newport wide
Outdoor Learning for All	Maes Ebbw School Parents Staff and Friends Association	Maes-Glas
Expect Respect Newport	St Giles Trust	Newport Wide
Knowledge PORTal	Newport People First	Maindee

## APPENDIX 3 - Delivery Agreement set out with Welsh Government.

### IWN Programme Milestones - 2021/22

#### **Objective 1 – Establish place-based co-ordination & development of well-being resources**

Facilitate the place-based wellbeing collaboratives to achieve the following:

##### **1a) Develop a shared ambition and identity that creates a social movement for wellbeing, underpinned by assets-based community development**

- Develop a set of underpinning principles, values and behaviours by which they'll operate, including branding / identify for each collaborative.
- Establish methods and resources for greater community involvement in the collaborative, including building on Community Champions and Explorers

##### **1b) Facilitate collaboration to achieve shared goals.**

- Develop a theory of change to detail the goals collaboratives want to achieve and the steps needed to get there.
- Develop and deliver a clear plan of improvement projects, based on the theory of change.
- Contribute to one cycle of participatory budgeting by identifying projects that require collective action.

##### **1c) Develop a sustainable footing for place-based collaboratives to continue.**

- Make an assessment of a broader base of leadership within the collaborative to build sustainability - Local collaboratives are empowered to take forward their own well-being agendas using an asset-based approach with the support of statutory bodies and third sector.

*N.B. Collaborative activity in each area will be driven by community needs, but will include:*

- *Recovery from the COVID-19 pandemic*
- *Progressing the mental well-being foundation tier (Melo and Connect Five training)*

#### **Objective 2 – Identify ways that hubs can be centres for well-being resources in the community.**

- Ensure each hub contributes to the place well-being network individually and collectively – including what can be done safely within the COVID alert levels.
- Ensure all hub staff and volunteers have been trained in Connect Five and join Well-being Friends.
- Ensure there is information about the total well-being offer in every hub
- Identify people who can share information and make connections between hubs.
- Identify people who can continuously identify new assets and community resources and share them with the well-being network.

#### **Objective 3 – Develop the well-being workforce (people delivering services & support)**

This area will re-focus from the original programme objectives to ensure people working in each place have the knowledge and skills to signpost to well-being support and support mental well-being:

- Support establishment of Connect Five mental well-being training system.
- Continue engagement with and support for Wellbeing Friends as part of COVID recovery plans.

**Objective 4 – Ensure easy access to well-being information & support.**

- Develop and deliver a communications plan through each well-being collaborative, so that people and local organisations are aware of what well-being resources are available, including mental well-being support via Melo.
- Develop a method to ensure Well-being Friends are kept up to date with local information and opportunities.
- Ensure strategic ownership of solutions to well-being information to agree a single way of providing it

**Objective 5 – Lay the foundations for a sustainable approach to Integrated Well-being Networks**

- Implement programme evaluation for 21/22
- Raise the profile of the programme with strategic partnerships and system leaders, through regular communications including quarterly PSB and RPB updates, newsletters, video stories
- Develop a clear ask of the resources required to sustain Well-being Collaboratives and community involvement (for example PSB Officer groups, RPB)
- Hold a follow-up Gwent stakeholder event to update on progress and early outcomes and views on sustainability of the programme.